

Appendix 4 – Vehicle matrix scoring

	Vehicle Option					Scoring Rationale
	Weighting	Company	Joint Committee	Outsource	Join Another Shared Service	
Alignment with overall vision	3	6	6	3	3	<p>An amalgamation of below.</p> <p>JC can be set up almost immediately and work commenced to deliver savings. Company would require a large TUPE transfer delaying any delivery of savings. Outsourcing would require contract specifications to be drawn up and an OJEU process delaying savings. Joining an existing shared service could be quicker but savings would be shared.</p> <p>Current legislation allows councils (Joint Committee) to provide services to other local authorities / public bodies outside of an OJEU process depending on demonstrating that there is genuine cooperation. A company would need to tender through an OJEU process to win external work, with a limit of 10% of JC minimises the pension fund issues as employees stay with existing council. Company approach would require a possible split of pension membership that is currently untested. Outsourcing and joining another shared service would have large consequences for the council's pension funds.</p> <p>The company board has total control of its own governance. For a JC two councils need to work together within each councils constitution. Outsourcing would be a contractual arrangement and a client side would be required. Joining a existing shared service if a JC would have same issues as for JC</p> <p>For JC and Company the councils still have control over decision making. With outsourcing and sharing with another shared service any flexibility is limited by the contractual arrangements and within a contract specification.</p> <p>Cultural change is more easily delivered when employees are employed by a distinct separate employer.</p> <p>Outsourcing could only be phased by service.</p> <p>To date a company has not been set up for such a wide range of services.</p> <p>Once a contractual arrangement is entered into it is more difficult to change the model of delivery. For JC and company the councils still have some level of direct control over decisions.</p> <p>JC and company can have direct control over where posts are located. This is not as easily delivered through the other two options.</p>
Lowest cost, at agreed quality delivered consistently	3	6	6	6	6	
Speed of benefit delivery	3	3	6	3	6	
Ease of gaining external work	3	3	6	0	3	
Pension Fund Issues	3	3	6	0	0	
Governance Effectiveness	2	4	2	2	2	
Flexibility regarding service delivery	2	4	4	2	2	
Resilience	2	4	4	4	4	
Options for cultural change	2	4	2	4	4	
Ability to provide phased approach	2	4	4	2	4	
Maturity of model	1	1	2	2	2	
Flexibility to evolve model	1	2	2	1	1	
Local employment opportunities	1	2	2	1	1	
Total Score		46	52	30	38	
Fully meets criteria	2					
Partially meets criteria	1					
Does not meet criteria	0					